

**Palestinian Woman's Identity Shift from Implicit-Being to Explicit-Becoming: A
Review of Susan Abulhawa's *Against the Loveless World***

* Khadija Bibi, MPhil Scholar

** Abdul Rashid, Lecturer (Corresponding Author)

*** Unaiza Khudai, PhD Scholar

Abstract



Susan Abulhawa takes the concept of Palestinian Woman's Identity Shift on account of the Israeli-Palestinian conflict and experiences of homelessness. Her novel, Against the Loveless World, has been selected for this study. The present study on account of being qualitative in nature has been thematically analyzed in the light of Stuart Hall theory of representation (1997). In the light of analyzed data, we find that Palestinians are transported from their ancestral lands to refugee camps without crossing international borders. Characters of the novel Against the Loveless World demonstrate how difficult it is to tackle all these issues and build a Palestinian identity while living in exile. Palestinians' exile boosted their sense of national identity by developing strong bonds among refugees and strong anti-Israeli sentiment. The protagonist fought for love and belonging in a world that wanted to give her nothing. Nahr's life unfolds in unexpected directions like imperialism, invasion, occupation, and colonialism; racism, sexism, psychological diseases, and class are the context of her life. On the brink of poverty and shouldering the responsibility to keep her family afloat, Nahr struggled for everything she could do to ensure her survival. She suffers much. She survives. Nahr is willing to face dangers, and she proves the gritty realness of women's trek toward feminist defiance and individual dignity. Nahr is determined to find love in a loveless world, a ray of hope for others. This is a woman's journey from Being nothing to becoming something, being a victim and traumatized character to becoming powerful and determined to survive and constructing an individual identity in a loveless world. It vindicates the significant process of identity shift taking place in Palestinian fiction.

Keywords: Being, Victimization and Trauma, Identity Crisis, Identity Reformation, Survival, Becoming

Introduction

The question of 'identity' is being vigorously debated in social theory. In essence, the argument is that the old identities which stabilized the social world for so long are in decline, giving rise to new identities and fragmenting the modern individual as a unified subject. Thus so-called 'crisis of identity' is seen as part of a wider process of change which is dislocating the central structures and processes of modern societies and undermining the frameworks which give individual anchorage in the social world. According to Kierkegaard (1940), existentialism "is a rejection of all purely abstract thinking, of a purely logical or scientific philosophy; in short, a rejection of the absoluteness of reason". Only concrete things can exist. Humans are the concrete individual who can exist. To be existent, one should have consciousness of being existent. So a concrete individual (human being) is conscious of existence and can be existent. Kierkegaard (1940), was the first to use the term "existence" in religious aspects that one should have a sense of self-realization. Existence primarily can be the investigation of the meaning of Being, to which an individual can select the meanings for his representation from being to becoming. Existentialism mainly concentrates on the individual's inner and personal experiences and knowledge as evidence because the personal is real. Personal experiences are considered as the philosophy of being and then becoming and self-realization, the philosophy of existence, and a refusal of the attempt to rationalize and to think of being.

* Department of English, Institute of Southern Punjab, Multan, Pakistan

** Department of English, Bahadur Sub Campus Layyah, Pakistan Email: abdulrashid@bzu.edu.pk

*** Department of English, University Teknologi Malaysia

It means that man can live without food but not without identity. This process of identification is of much value and significance. When we talk with reference to the women of disadvantageous position, Women in Palestine are true picture of dual marginalization i.e. being a woman and Palestinian. The present study is an attempt to explore the perspective of Palestinian women's identity shift from implicit being to explicit becoming. The present study explores that how does Abulhawa's *Against the Loveless World* (2019) describe the journey of identification from being to becoming?

Literature Review

Jacobs (2018), stated that literature is considered a way to fight back by oppressed people, but it's also important to view literature as a way to show how much you love your home. In Arabic literature, especially Palestinian literature, this technique has been used a lot recently. Middle Eastern writers have often idealized their country as a woman, enabling them to demonstrate their patriotism by portraying their homeland in terms of feminine aesthetic traits. When they talk of their love for their motherland, they often employ language and images that generate emotions of closeness with the object of their affection. According to them, Arab writers have always addressed their work directly to their country by using the second person pronoun in their works. In more recent writings, this traditional style has been abandoned in favor of a proclivity to represent the homeland using language usually associated with women in Arab culture. The phrase "homeland," which is commonly used in poetry to indicate "homeland," literally means "earth" and is classified as a feminine noun in the grammatical hierarchy. Therefore, this tradition may have its origins in linguistics. Another feminine phrase that may evoke a feeling of "homeland" is (balad).

Regarding linguistics, writing in Arabic has no option but to use feminine pronouns when referring to sentences like these. Many ancient civilizations had the custom of naming cities after female goddesses like Athena or addressing them with the feminine pronoun. Many cultures have adopted the concept of the motherland as proof of their attachment to the land, he believes, demonstrating a symbolic link between the land and femininity. When defining the concept of homeland, numerous female authors have used the masculine word (watan) since it allows them to equate this love to an intimate tie between a lover and his beloved. The usage of the word "homeland" does not seem to be consistent with a gendered difference in the use of language when referring to one's "homeland" in the Arab world. The colonizer is usually shown as a man when looking at this dilemma from a colonial perspective. At the same time, the colonized territory is depicted as a woman, resulting in a symbolic relationship between the motherland and the lady. People who wrote about post-colonial issues say that feminist ideas are important because they have the following features.

Saadi (2002) claimed that Palestinians' exile boosted their sense of national identity by developing strong bonds among refugees and strong anti-Israeli sentiment. Consequently, Arab identity was predicated on the contradictory features of Palestinian-ness and Zionism. This is why one of the most repeated clichés is the land, which resists Israeli infrastructure modernization and is often referred to as a caring mother or feminine lover. Olive trees and olive blooms (thyme), valleys (figs), and valleys (figs) are all metaphors used to define Palestinian identity (figs). Olive oil is often utilized for everything from cooking to lighting to creating soap, even though the ability to survive on poor soil and tolerate drought and other unfavorable climates are more significant than any other trait of Palestinian-ness. Because the Israelis wanted to erase Palestinian identity, they backed the removal of olive trees in favor of cypress trees. The oldest trees on the planet may be found in Palestine; as "keepers of time," they symbolize Palestinian endurance and history. Israeli acts consider Palestine 'a territory without people for a people without land', trees are described as an example of physical evidence of Palestinian existence, and their destruction highlights Israel's wickedness. Trees and other environmental features play a significant role in these narratives because they are living creatures that both preserve and educate the world about Palestinian culture.

Altmani (2017), points out that traditional Palestinian literature often depicts plants, such as figs, oranges, pomegranates, and olive trees. They are used as "cultural markers in the creation of both Palestinian and Israeli community memory" by both Palestinians and Israelis (p.148). Bardenstein(2002), claimed that these symbols signify weakness in both societies. For Palestinians, trees represent their exiled homeland, providing protection, legitimacy, and a feeling of belonging. Aside from their significance in maintaining collective memory, trees have several social and economic implications. Agriculture is an important aspect of the Palestinian economy and culture.

Palestinian-ness may be represented in many ways, including via trees. The Israeli strategy of removing and replacing trees reflects not only the deterritorialization of Palestinian land but also the symbolic importance of trees as a genuinely rooted act inside Palestinian territory tied to God's promised return to the Holy Land.

Trees are "the restoration of an absent immediate bond between land and people that had long been absent" for Israelis, rather than being "sites of Palestinian collective memory at different points of dislocation and disruption of the Palestinian bond between land and people refugism" for Palestinians (p.157). Contemporary Palestinian writers have a more complicated relationship with signs of Palestinian roots because they were not born during the Nakba and did not witness it firsthand; this complicates their interpretations of tree symbolism, which is used in both Palestinian and Israeli nationalist movements. As a result, trees convey a physical sense of belonging to Abulhawa and an ideal past that is no longer available to genuine Palestinians. Kanafani & Harlow (2000), state that Pre-Nakba Palestinian literature was the same as Arab general literature. Due to common culture, religion, and language, Arabic literature from other countries that speak Arabic had a lot of the same themes and concerns as Palestinian writing before the Nakba.

Taraki (2006), stated that Nakba had an impact on literature because the major theme of most novels after 1948 was the near-tragic encounter between a protagonist and an "outside" force." They also included poetry and novellas writing as an example. These writings throw themselves at the service of life, reflecting the notion of writing at the time. According to them, writing was recognized as a tool of resistance, notably after the Naksa rebellion in 1967. Taraki (2006), concentrated on Arab writers' narrative methods and feels that the separation of differently constituted events in novels published in Arabic reflects the Arabs' existential stance. The phrase "literature of resistance" has become intrinsically tied with post-Nakba Palestinian literary production since resistance became an important mode of life for Palestinians as a whole, with all members of society attempting to protect their country in whatever manner they could.

While the media often portrays resistance in terms of dramatic pictures of military battles, resistance in Palestine is seen as encompassing the whole nation, from political activists to academics and literary writers to the ordinary populace. Although ordinary Palestinians have traditionally protested by throwing stones (thus their nickname "the people of stones"), poets and academics have turned to literature as a method of protecting their land and expressing themselves. Palestinian writings are a statement of solidarity with the doomed, the deprived, the victimized, and the underprivileged, while a witness is defined as a figure in whom the truth-telling urge and the compulsion to identify with the oppressed become necessary and integral to the art of writing itself. Any figure with whom the truth-telling urge and the impulse to identify is characterized as a witness in this context.

Salih & Richter-Devroe (2014) stated that resistance in the Palestinian context is described as a kind of reaction to the prevailing political, social, and cultural realities of a nation that considers itself to be under siege. The exploration of the cultural and historical context to unveil the hidden truth, which is done through the employment of allusions to Palestine's silent and forgotten history and culture, is a vital component of this act of Palestinian resistance. This kind of literary work might be considered a rewriting of history to restore what has been erased on purpose. They described Palestinian resistance literature as a rejection of Zionist attempts to erase Palestine's historical presence and Islamic culture from history. During their second cycle of deconstruction, the Palestinian resistance writers examined how their own history as a people had been depicted and deconstructed to demonstrate their existence in Palestine before the occupation and affirm their inherited right to Palestinian territory. From this perspective, the rise in Israeli misrepresentations of Palestinians as terrorists in the international media is particularly significant, especially when Palestinian writers try to convey the truth about Israel's occupation through their literature. The second primary purpose of Palestinian resistance literature is to document Palestinians' ordinary lives and to bear witness to the anguish caused by the loss of their homes and long periods of exile, which is the second most significant goal of Palestinian resistance writing.

According to Hamdi (2011), the act of 'bearing witness' can be considered a literary sub-genre since it reflects what has been suppressed by the dominant narrative of society's more powerful group. This narrative style resurrects the tragedy's past and calls attention to the core causes of the civil war. When it comes to the features of Palestinian resistance writings, it is an incredible

revolutionary energy that is free of any sadness or grief. This is shown by their conviction that this type of writing is not a declaration of self-pity in the face of tragedy but rather a sign of strength and will. Early works of post-Nakba resistance writings have a number of characteristics. The following remark is made by them. These writers' deep ties to their homeland, as well as their feeling of belonging to their own people, are evident in their work. However, according to the study, there is no evidence of anti-Semitic attitudes against Israelis or their religious beliefs. They also point out that the works of resistance poets are often linked to the writers' own lives. Finally, evidence of foreign political influences, notably Pan-Arabism and Nasserism, can be found: Most Palestinian resistance writers supported Marxist ideals, which fuelled their enthusiasm and heightened their emotions in reaction to Israeli imperialist operations.

Rooney (2014) stated that writers used their creative writing to openly convey their feelings of loss for their homeland and assert their Palestinian identity in the face of worldwide resistance. A prominent figure in Palestinian writings addressed issues such as the sale of Palestinian land to Jews, a lack of awareness of Zionism's dangers in other parts of the Arab world, concern over factional conflicts among Palestinians, and Palestinian men having sexual relations with Jewish women. He also emphasized the joy that Palestinians get from joyful occasions. Mir (2015), highlighted the sorrow and pain of being a Palestinian in exile by presenting the nuances of his countrymen's political, social-psychological, and economic existence while also writing about his own personal experiences from his own perspective. He also brings up other challenges that come with being a Palestinian, such as relocation, diasporic exile, and isolation from family and friends. They reviewed *I saw Ram Ullah* and stated that the title refers to Barghouti's return to Ramallah after thirty years in exile as a metaphor for achieving the apparently unattainable through hard effort and perseverance. Furthermore, this shows the uniqueness of the Palestinian setting, where a short trip to a place just a few miles away takes on the symbolic significance of an epic journey to a legendary site filled with longing and yearning.

Later on, universalism emerged as another approach to Palestinian resistance literature, which in its most basic definition means taking a position on the conflict in Palestine that sees it not as a conflict between Muslims and Jews, nor as a conflict between non-Arabs, but as a power struggle between oppressor and oppressed. They stated that Palestinian writers had employed the approach of drawing parallels between the Palestinian people's persecution and the oppression experienced by other groups and nations throughout history. Consequently, they depicted a more abstract image of tyranny to convey a general message against harsh and unjust behaviour. The expression "victims of victims" was created about Palestinians and alludes to the passing on of repressive shackles from one country to another, with the same oppressed nation narrative now applicable to Palestinians as it was to Jews during WWII, expressing this form of universality.

Garloff (2005) stated that trauma and displacement in postwar German Jewish Writers, there are interesting parallels to be drawn between Palestinian writers' role and Jewish authors' role in bearing witness to their nation's history of oppression and persecution by the Nazis. In the aftermath of the Holocaust, Jewish writers raised a voice for oppressed people who had been forced to migrate geographically and culturally due to the Holocaust. Furthermore, Garloff feels that literature may assist in the process of coming to terms with diasporic exile. As a result, Palestinian writers have embraced Jewish testimonial writing ideas to provide evidence in response to the Nakba, which has proved effective. In short, we reach to a point that formation of identity is subject to the politics of representation. In such the politics of representation the identity of Palestinian has always been matter of misrepresented. Consequently, the Palestinian had a quest and desire for their "own identity". This stance moves us to take Hall's theory of representation as framework of our study. We see that due to the Palestine- Israel ongoing conflicts, the fiction from and about Palestine could not get much prominence in the academia and research studies. The present study is an attempt to bridge this gap.

Framework

In this sociological conception, identity bridges the gap between the 'inside' and the 'outside' between the personal and the public worlds. The fact that we project 'ourselves' into these cultural identities while internalizing their meanings and values and making them 'part of us' helps to align our subjective feelings with the objective 'places we occupy in the social and cultural world. Identity thus stitches (or, to use a current medical metaphor, 'sutures' the subject into the structure. It stabilizes both subjects and their cultural worlds, making both reciprocally more predictable. Yet these are

exactly what is now said to be 'shifting'. The subject, previously experienced as having a unified and stable identity, is becoming fragmented, composed, not of a single, but several, sometimes contradictory or unresolved, identities.

In effect, the concept of identity is 'under erasure' in the breach between departure and arrival. This conception cannot be taken and admitted in the already existing ideas, but outwardly certain basic inquiries cannot be taken at all. Another type of justification considers where the concept of identity emerges in relation to a set of problems. The answer lies in the question of politics. Through politics, I take both the significance in modern aspects of political moves of the signifier 'identity' and its polar connection to a politics of position and the demonstration of challenges and instabilities that have damaged all recent designs of 'identity politics'. To return to the lucid approach of the subject of identity as the primary author of social exercise or to recover access which injects its own conception at the foundation of all historicity, which directs to an objective and concrete recognition of the concept of identity (Foucault, 1970). I stand with Foucault that what we need here is 'not a concept of the certain subject, but a theory of discursive recitation. I consider that Foucault's work clearly shows what this concept requires is not a surrender or invalidation of 'the subject' but a reconstruction of the idea and taking it in its reshaped and decentered existence within the model.

Textual Analysis

Against the loveless world (2019) is a novel by Susan Abulhawa, a Palestinian-American writer and political activist. Abulhawa writes a blend of facts and fiction. This is a story told by Nahr, a woman who reflects on her past from a cell known as the cube in Israel as a political prisoner and is trying to develop her own sense of identity. This is about the challenges of living in occupied lands, being a female where women are not treated equally, about homosexuality and the stigma surrounding it. It's about finding an identity and belonging, love, forgiveness, hope, and the power of friendship. This is a powerful story of a family living through war and instability. There are also perspectives of destruction caused by the United States' involvement in the Gulf War. It is one women's story not only about her struggles and disappointments but also her joys, her beloved family connections, and hope against all odds.

The major character is Nahr, a daughter of Palestinian refugees who represents living a life in a war-torn country and trying to construct her identity. Nahr, a devoted sister who'd die for her brother. True to the title, this is the journey of Nahr against the loveless world. A story so raw, gritty, graphic, dark, hard to read and poignant. This is about the grim reality of Palestinians and how much injustice they still continue to suffer. Characters are facing some social unrest in this fiction. Abulhawa's novel presents us with a cast of incredible female characters who have experienced some of the worst manifestations of patriarchy, colonialism, exile, and repatriation. Nahr reconstructs and recreates a life that has been brutalized and traumatized. Nahr chooses life and the fight for dignity and liberation.

Injustice and suffering of refugees

Refugees exercise stressful events because of state policies. Political or religious oppression, war, migration and re-settlement— it is impossible to describe all the traumatic effects of refugees because they may suffer a lot of imprisonment, loss of property, extreme physical fear, rape and loss of livelihood. Palestinians face all these sufferings and injustice, particularly from the protagonist's family (Nahr). They live in a new state that is the new host for refugees and they live in an uncertain future. Loss of identity, reconstruction of identity, and handling living problem is harsh for refugees.

Trust me, Nahr. We should really try to get residency cards. We are unwanted in the world. It couldn't hurt for us to have another option, even if we don't use it. How long do you think we've got before something happens here and Jordan kicks us out to God knows where? (p.138)

The major issue with refugees is the issue of residency. The major trauma of refugees is residency cards. The new host country will also kick them, and they are living with an uncertain future and don't know when and where something will happen, and they will fall prey to exploitation. They face racism and discrimination. These are all the suffering of Palestinians depicted by Abulhawa in *Against the loveless world*.

Patriarchy

In Palestine, women struggle against gendered violence by their own society and Israeli occupation. Patriarchy exists in Palestine as a system that upholds male dominance and male hierarchies. It enforces gender binaries and stereotypes to preserve the current power structure. While patriarchy

affects everyone, its violent manifestations disproportionately affect women. Some women face violence and abuse within the family and in social circles. Racialising the discourse on violence against women in Palestine is obfuscating the larger context of violence Palestinian women suffer from. Patriarchy exists in Palestine not only in the form of problematic social dynamics and gendered violence among Palestinians but also in the form of occupation and settler colonialism, *"Until I met Um Buraq, it had never occurred to me that patriarchy was anything but the natural order of life. She was the first woman I met who truly hated men. She said it openly and without apology. (p.68)*

Fighting for our liberation comes with dangerous consequences for us as women. When we protest, we know that our bodies may be used as weapons against us. We may be sexually harassed or assaulted. Palestinian women are subjected to various forms of harassment and torture. Indeed Palestine is a perfect example of how patriarchy works to keep women poor and marginalized under a devastating system of oppression.

Anarchy

There is an absence of law or any settled government in Israel. People's lives are badly affected by this state of lawlessness or political disorder due to the absence of political authority. According to the international relations theory, anarchy is something in which the world lacks supreme power or government, resulting in lawlessness, disputes and war. In the anarchist state, there is power distribution, and people are unsafe in this state. This result in violence and safety risks. Susan Abulhawa's protagonist faces the same kind of restlessness and safety risks in Palestine. Israel has a lot of lame excuses to disturb the rest of the citizens of Palestine, like the main character, Nahr, who is one is the target of destruction by Israel. Then it has a lot of reasons to impose its power like you are the relatives of revolutionaries and fighters, you don't have permission to stay in this country, you have illegal wells and whatever reason they want. So Palestine is facing this kind of situation, and citizens are facing this restlessness, *"Israel has a lot of excuses. Lack of permits, illegal wells, relatives of fighters, whatever they want" (p.166)"*

Confusing Representation of women

There is a confusing representation of the main character Nahr in this novel as a women's identity in Palestinian society. The novel depicts multiple names of the protagonist, such as Nahr, Yaqoot, and Almas. We can see that women's identity is not represented equally to men. The protagonist is described with multiple names; at home, there is a different name (Nanu, Nahr), and Yaqoot is only on her official documents. Almas is the protagonist's name when she was a prostitute on the journey of survival and becoming, *"Sometimes, I'll tell you the story behind my having two names. Three, if you count Nanu, which is reserved for Jihad." Almas was long gone by then. (p.164)*

The protagonist is represented with multiple names; at home, there is a different name (Nanu, Nahr), and Yaqoot is only on her official documents. Almas is the protagonist's name when she was a prostitute on the journey of survival and becoming. The life of women in Palestine was one of a lost era. Procedure orientation, from the beginning of human life and evolution continuously, aims at knowing the real Being. But the presence of women was totally lost in that era. Nahr, the protagonist against the loveless world, tries to prove her identity and finally proves her existence as the daughter of refugees in occupied lands, *"Her life was one of a lost era, in some ways too idyllic to be real" (p.170)*

Fight for dignity and liberation

According to Sartre (2005), the "Being" is a manmade actuality firmly placed inside the nonspiritual reality, determined by Nothingness. The man of our era survives in an apex of existential agony and crisis. The divine values, the investigation for the truth, the struggle after Excellency, aeon, and inner peace are declined under the burden of the barbarous commercial claims. However, the actual Being of the human being, composed for the aeon and modelled according to changeless ethical doctrines and values, would unlimitedly aim to investigate for the truth, the affinity, the immaterial charm, the attainments, the chastity, and the baptismal of the human being are the canons which overcome the temporality and the nothingness.

I don't know what compelled me to write it all. To set the record straight? To lay bare with love what others find offensive? To pass the time? To mark my place in the world? To inject life into this lifeless box? To declare simply that I survived? (P.344)

Procedure orientation, from the beginning of human life and evolution continuously, aims at knowing the real Being, the inner reality of human existence. The search for the knowledge of the individual

reliable Being was the extreme object of life for a vast number of philosophers. Heraclitus opines that man attempted to come across his reliable Being; during Being, I designed myself. It is absurd to find the margins of the soul by going after any track, so deep and immense is its existence. The soul depicts the in-depth truth of the human being overlooked upon the psychosomatic Being of the human and rules of behaviour and achievement.

Residents weren't satisfied with the official report and continued moving out. The farm struggled to sustain itself. News articles reported that some of the residents who remained believed "the Arabs" had cast black-magic spells to curse them. They intended to remain confident that God was on their side. For them, it was a battle between God and the devil. But the colony was emptying by the day. We read it all and celebrated. (p.318)

Restored religion in the life of Nahr

Nahr's life underwent a massive change because religion restored her life. The repressed Palestinian, daughter of a refugee, visibly speechless over memory by the power of undergoing slavery and generally detached from her religion, is now peaceful because she is in Palestine again and has begun joining the family of Bilal for morning salat and then again for dhuhr salat. Soon she was worshipping five times a day, "*I began joining Hajjeh Um Muhammad and Bilal for morning salat and then again for the dhuhr salat. Soon I was worshipping five times a day*" (p.169)

Unspoken presence of Palestine in everything

Palestine was, indeed, present in all aspects like in everyday life and fashion of the slave quarters, in the languages and regional dialect of the newly established colony, in names and words, generally detached from their taxonomies, in the unseen syntactical anatomy through which more languages were spoken, in the course of events and tales displayed to children, in religious modes and acceptance in the devotional life, the arts, knack, music and rhythms of slave and post-liberal government society. Signified Palestine, which could not be expressed at once in slavery, be left and still extant the unspoken and unspeakable 'presence'. It is 'hiding' after each lingual curvature, each narrative contorts of cultural condition. It is the hidden rule with which every Western text was re-read. It is the foundation compass of each rhythm and bodily movement.

It looks so much like the landscape of Palestine. Like the view over the orchards, Bilal and I used to look upon. I indulge in an illicit fantasy of a world that would have allowed us to simply live, raise children, hold jobs, move freely on earth, and grow old together. (p. 354)

Concept of identity under erasure

In effect, the concept of identity is 'under erasure' in the breach between departure and arrival. This conception cannot be taken and admitted in the already existing ideas, but outwardly certain basic inquiries cannot be taken at all. Another type of justification considers where the concept of identity emerges in relation to a set of problems. The answer lies in the question of politics. Through politics, I take both the significance in modern aspects of political moves of the signifier 'identity' and its polar connection to a politics of position and the demonstration of challenges and instabilities that have damaged all recent designs of 'identity politics'. To return to the lucid approach of the subject of identity as the primary author of social exercise or to recover access which injects its own conception at the foundation of all historicity, which directs to an objective and concrete recognition of the concept of identity (Foucault, 1970). I stand with Foucault that what we need here is 'not a concept of the certain subject, but a theory of discursive recitation.

"These people are trying to wipe away all traces of us. I'm going to do whatever it takes. Even though they pump poison and sewage into our wells and springs, all I'm trying to do is spook them enough to make them leave. So, yes, that's what I'm doing, and I thank you for having the brilliant idea in the first place." (p. 309)

I consider that Foucault's work clearly shows what this concept requires is not a surrender or invalidation of 'the subject' but a reconstruction of the idea and taking it in its reshaped and decentered existence within the model. Here seems to be in the struggle to restate the bond among the concept and paradoxical conventions that the inquiry of identity come again or if one adopts to import the process of interpretation in terms of subjective experiences to paradoxical exercises, and the politics of Coventry which all such subjective interpretation appears to bring about the question of identification. Identification is one of the complicated concepts that are less understood yet and approximately as catchy as preferable to 'identity' itself; there is definitely no assurance for the conceptual challenges that have aggress the latter. It draws interpretations from both the paradoxical

and the psychoanalytic aptitudes beyond being bound, *"This is what I finally understood: The compounds he was cooking up were called phthalates. They are anti-androgenic, which means they will feminize men and weaken their sperm"* (p.309)

The question of identity and its sense of being with senseless ways of creation and reformation has been established within the address of a psychoanalytical spell of feminism and cultural criticism. The never-ending formation of self has been excellent in exalted alternatives of postmodernism. Critique within the concept of ethnic, racial and national aspects and definitions of identity and the 'politics of location', some bold codified images about identity have been formed in their most rooted frames. Then what is the need for more and more debates and uncountable assessments about 'identity'? Who needs it? This question can be reached in two approaches. The first approach is to behold something unique about the deconstructive critique to which these immanent concepts and ideas are directed. Those contradictory schemes of critique which target to eject insufficient notions with 'truer' or seek to formulate positive knowledge, the deconstructive access keeps crucial considerations 'under erasure'.

This shows that they are no for more time advantageous or preferable to think within their initial or without their restored forms. But since, they have not been removed dialectically and there are no other fully changed approaches to displace them but to carry forward to assume with them. Admitting that now their deconstructed designs, and no longer in effect within the ideal in which they were basically accomplished (Hall, 1997). Contradictory concepts that reject them allow them to go on being recognized. Derrida has interpreted this concept as admitting the boundary, as taking it into account in double writing. By the instrument of this double and accurate ranks, ejected and dislocated writing, we must also take into account the delay among alteration, which takes low what was high, and the irruptive outgrowth of a new 'concept'. This concept can never be and never could be enclosed in the existing establishment (Derrida, 1981).

Belonging an Illusion

For the protagonist, her country looks like an illusion when she returns to Palestine. It was her mother and grandmother's country, but now it seems like it was not her country, and Palestine does not want her. Palestine looks imaginative and strange. The country that was the refugees' homeland now looks like a strange place to Nahr. Abulhawa states that it seems an illusion when Nahr comes back to her country because Palestine does not want her.

The belonging and acceptance I had found seemed an illusion. Palestine was my mother's world. It belonged to Sitti Wasfiyeh's stories. Palestine did not want me, nor I her any longer. I was again untethered and vulnerable, a stranger in a place that had felt like home. (P.192)

Homeland

Palestine is Abulhawa's homeland, and she describes her feelings through the character of Nahr. Nahr is the protagonist of the novel *Against the Loveless World* and returns to her homeland and sits on the top of a hill. Nahr loves the pleasures and satisfaction which come from her Palestine. I was satisfied to just sit there in the splendid silence of the hills, where the quiet pleasures of small sounds, the wind rustling trees, sheep chewing, roaming, bleating, breathing, the soft flames of the fire, the purr of Bilal's breathing. I realized how much I had come to love these hills and how profound my link to this soil was. How pleasurable was her link to this soil? How amazing and satisfier was her homeland? How satisfying was each phenomenon of nature in her homeland?

I was content to just sit there in the splendid silence of the hills, where the quiet amplified small sounds—the wind rustling trees; sheep chewing, roaming, bleating, breathing; the soft crackle of the fire; the purr of Bilal's breathing. I realized how much I had come to love these hills; how profound was my link to this soil. (P.194)

Conclusion

Abulhawa states that Nahr was trying to construct her identity and for freedom of her homeland. At last, she constructed and survived her own identity and thought that she never thought there would come a day when women could just sit in outdoor cafes and smoke like men. In postmodernity, Bauman (2005) argues that every aspect of society is subject to change, with the workforce lacking direction in its attempt to maintain flexibility. Therefore, identities are constantly being altered to adapt to these changes in circumstances. The shift in identity from the modern to postmodern eras is described by Bauman as the change 'from Pilgrim to Tourist'. During modernity, identity could be compared to a pilgrimage, with the person knowing exactly what their goals are and what is required

to reach them. However, in postmodern times, individuals' identities are compared with the 'tourist'. The same as happens in the novel, *Against the Loveless World*. Her protagonist is strong enough to make herself strong, encouraged and committed to her goals. She constructed her identity back in her country and finally survived as the daughter of a refugee in occupied lands.

The writings of Palestinian fiction writers can be examined through the lens of Hall's theory of representation. Other writings of Abulhawa like *Mornings in Jenin* (2010), *The Blue Between Sky and Water* (2015), *Shattered Illusions*, anthology (2002), *Searching Jenin*, anthology (2003), *Seeking Palestine: New Palestinian Writing on Exile and Home* anthology (2012), *My Voice Sought The Wind*, poetry collection (2013), *This Is Not A Border: Reportage & Reflections from the Palestine Festival of Literature* (2017) can also be examined through the same lens. It is possible to conclude, that the present study is useful to scholars interested in Palestinian women fiction.

References

- Altomani, L. (2017). "Dressed in olive branches and cracked happiness": Palestinian identity in Susan Abulhawa and Nathalie Handal.
- Bardenstein, C. (2002). Transmissions interrupted: Reconfiguring food, memory, and gender in the cookbook-memoirs of Middle Eastern exiles. *Signs: Journal of Women in Culture and Society*, 28(1), 353-387.
- Bauman, R. (2005). Commentary: Indirect indexicality, identity, performance: Dialogic observations. *Journal of Linguistic Anthropology*, 15(1), 145-150.
- Baudrillard, J. (1994). *Simulacra and simulation*. University of Michigan press.
- Derrida, J. (1981). *Semiotology and grammatology*. Na.
- Foucault, M. (1970). La situation de Cuvier dans l'histoire de la biologie. *Revue d'histoire des sciences et de leurs applications*, 23(1), 63-69.
- Garloff, K. (2005). *Words from Abroad: Trauma and Displacement in Postwar German Jewish Writers*. Wayne State University Press.
- Hamdi, T. (2011). Bearing witness in Palestinian resistance literature. *Race & Class*, 52(3), 21-42.
- Hall, S. (1997). Cultural identity and diaspora. 1997, 222-237.
- Heidegger, M. (2007). *Becoming Heidegger: On the trail of his early occasional writings, 1910-1927*. Northwestern University Press.
- Jacobs, R. (2018). Ramzy Baroud, *The Last Earth: A Palestinian Story*.
- Kanafani, G., & Harlow, B. (2000). *Palestine's children: returning to Haifa & other stories* (pp. 185-187). Boulder: Lynne Rienner Publishers.
- Kierkegaard, S. (1940). *Stages on life's way: Studies by various persons*
- Mir, S. (2015). Mourid Barghouti: The blessings of exile. *Arab Studies Quarterly*, 37(4), 311-333.
- Rooney, C. (2014). Prison Israel-Palestine: literalities of criminalization and imaginative resistance. *Journal of Postcolonial Writing*, 50(2), 134-147
- Sa'di, A. H. (2002). Catastrophe, memory and identity: Al-Nakbah as a component of Palestinian identity. *Israel Studies*, 7(2), 175-198.
- Salih, R., & Richter-Devroe, S. (2014). Cultures of resistance in Palestine and beyond: On the politics of art, aesthetics, and affect. *The Arab Studies Journal*, 22(1), 8-27.
- Sartre, J. P. (2005). Existentialism is a humanism [lecture]. *Kaufmann W. Existentialism from Dostoyevsky to Sartre*.
- Taraki, L. (Ed.). (2006). *Living Palestine: Family survival, resistance, and mobility under occupation*. Syracuse University Press.